

---

# Avoiding the Tragedy of the Horizon

Designing effective portfolios for  
climate-related risk management and  
the transition to low-carbon economies

---

**Jennifer Bender PhD**

Director of Research, Global Equity Beta Solutions

**Kushal Shah, MS**

Research Associate, Global Equity Beta Solutions

---

# Avoiding the Tragedy of the Horizon

---

Bank of England Governor Mark Carney's *Tragedy of the Horizon* speech brought renewed focus to a subject that we've been researching for many years — that of climate-related investing.

In this paper, we summarise some of our latest thinking and insights on how best to design portfolios to manage climate-related risks and the low-carbon energy transition.

Increasing evidence of climate change combined with increased regulatory action have been generating rapid innovation in climate investing. Now no longer confined to small satellite allocations in their portfolios, investors are seeking integration methods at the total portfolio level.

---

## How Do Investors Meet the Latest EU Standards?

One example of the increasing regulatory environment is the latest European regulation on investment benchmarks. Part of the European Commission's Action Plan on Financing Sustainable Growth, regulation has been amended, resulting in two important new measures regarding investment benchmarks.

The first is the creation of two types of climate benchmarks — the EU Climate Transition Benchmark (EU CTB) and EU Paris-Aligned Benchmark (EU PAB). The second measure is the definition of Environmental, Social and Governance (ESG) disclosure requirements that will apply to all investment benchmarks. The stated main objectives of the new climate benchmarks are to:

1. Allow improved comparability of climate benchmarks methodologies while leaving flexibility in methodology design.
2. Provide investors with an appropriate tool that is aligned to their investment strategy.
3. Increase transparency on investors' impact, specifically with regard to climate change and the energy transition.
4. Disincentivize greenwashing.

For many investors these new climate benchmarks will now be the gold standard to aim for. The question is: How should investors get there? To help investors, we present a summary of how our latest research feeds into designing effective portfolios that align directly to the benchmarks.

## 6 Portfolio-Level Designs for Climate Change

The specific portfolio construction approaches we examine here are related to three well-known general approaches to climate-conscious investing: divestment, climate mitigation, and climate adaptation.

The **divestment approach** is targeted at selling all ownership positions in the fossil fuel-based economy by removing exposure to the energy, utility, and material sectors. Collectively, these sectors contain over 80% of global carbon emissions and fossil fuel reserves. The **mitigation approach** involves an explicit objective to reduce the flow of heat-trapping greenhouse gases into the atmosphere and increase exposure to new energy and “green” companies. The **adaptation approach** involves an explicit objective to increase exposure to companies adjusting to actual or expected future climate impacts (i.e. the physical impacts of climate change).

Mitigation and adaptation are complementary approaches for reducing risks of climate change impacts over different timescales — and ideally align with the objective of most institutional investors to balance short-term risks with long-term opportunities.

We show the three main approaches integrated into six portfolio-level designs: three examples of Screening-Based Portfolios, aligned to the EU Climate Transition Benchmark (EU CTB) and three of Optimization-Based Portfolios, two again aligned with the EU CTB and one to the EU Paris-Aligned Benchmark (EU PAB).

Screening Based	Optimization Based
<p><i>Approach 1: Screened Portfolio Targeting in the EU Climate Transition Benchmark</i> This approach broadly involves excluding or screening out a set of securities from their investment universe. We study three specific cases:</p> <p><b>Case 1: 30% Carbon Reduction Target (by screening 2.5%)</b> At each date, we screen out the worst 2.5% of polluters (measured by carbon intensity) in the benchmark. This results in an approximately 30% carbon intensity reduction.</p> <p><b>Case 2: 50% Carbon Reduction Target (by screening 10%)</b> At each date, we screen out the worst 10% of polluters (measured by carbon intensity) in the benchmark. This results in an approximately 50% carbon intensity reduction.</p> <p><b>Case 3: Exclude GICS E/M/U</b> At each date, we screen out all securities belonging to the Energy, Materials, and Utilities sectors (the three highest carbon emitting sectors).</p>	<p><i>Approach 2: Optimized Portfolio Targeting in the EU Climate Transition Benchmark</i> In this approach, we use optimization to achieve a specified level of carbon intensity reduction relative to a market cap weighted benchmark, a portfolio that assigns market cap weight to all securities in its universe.</p> <p><b>Case 4: 30% Carbon Reduction Target</b></p> <p><b>Case 5: 50% Carbon Reduction Target</b></p> <p><i>Approach 3: Optimized Portfolio Targeting the European Union Paris-Aligned Benchmark</i> Similarly to Approach 2, we use optimization to achieve carbon intensity reduction</p> <p><b>Case 6: Target EU PAB</b> Now we also incorporate four additional climate metrics. Specifically, we target a reduction in fossil fuels, a reduction in brown revenues, an improvement in green revenues, and an improvement in climate adaptation.</p>

## Successful Climate Integration

In the next section we review some of our key observations but, in short, our research shows that climate considerations can easily be integrated into portfolios in a number of different ways.

Also, alignment to the latest EU benchmarks is obtainable in such a way as to also maintain a low tracking error (versus the benchmark MSCI World Index). We also find that substantial improvements in green revenue exposure and climate risk adaptation as well as significant reductions in carbon intensity, fossil fuel reserves exposure and brown revenue exposure are all achievable.

## Some Key Observations

**Low tracking error is possible:** Optimized portfolios that integrate additional climate metrics and align with the EU PAB can be built with low tracking error. Only 32 basis points of tracking error is needed to achieve substantive improvements in green revenue exposure and climate risk adaptation alongside reductions in carbon intensity, fossil fuel reserves exposure, and brown revenue exposure. This approach offers a powerful way to incorporate alternative and/or forward-looking climate variables.

**Screening can exhibit reasonably high tracking error,** as much as 1.38% for Case 3 where the energy, materials, and utilities are excluded. In other words, if relative returns are normally distributed, then roughly two-thirds of the time, the portfolio's returns would be expected to fall within -138 basis points and +138 basis points of the benchmark.

The **same amount of carbon reduction** that is achieved through screening (30% and 50% for Cases 1 and 2) **can be achieved at lower tracking error.** The optimized portfolio is more compelling, particularly for investors who want minimum deviation of tracking error from their market cap weighted benchmarks.

**Screening results in a loss of exposure to green revenues.** This happens because the screening approach excludes companies from the materials and utilities sectors, which have higher concentrations of green companies.

**Active returns for all six portfolio-level designs are small and positive:** Sharpe Ratios are equivalent to the market cap weighted benchmark; and Information Ratios are positive. These results indicate that climate considerations can be easily integrated in a range of different ways.

## Performance Summary

	Hypothetical	Screening-Based			Optimization-Based		
	Ref	Case 1	Case 2	Case 3	Case 4	Case 5	Case 6
	MSCI World Index	30% Carbon Reduction	50% Carbon Reduction	Exclude GICS E/M/U	30% Carbon Reduction	50% Carbon Reduction	EU PAB Strategy
Annual Return (%)	9.94	9.99	10.25	11.09	10.05	10.07	10.30
Annual Vol (%)	11.46	11.55	11.51	11.54	11.44	11.42	11.43
Sharpe Ratio	0.87	0.86	0.89	0.96	0.88	0.88	0.90
Active Return (%)	–	0.05	0.31	1.15	0.11	0.13	0.36
Tracking Error (%)	–	0.19	0.43	1.38	0.14	0.19	0.32
Information Ratio	–	0.26	0.72	0.84	0.78	0.70	1.15
Maximum Drawdown (%)	-13.31	-13.52	-13.43	-13.16	-13.28	-13.16	-13.13
Beta	–	1.01	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Number of Stocks (avg)	1636	1595	1473	1326	1078	1030	928
Effective No. of Stocks (avg)	350	341	313	282	347	336	325
Carbon Intensity	–	32.2	55.3	65.0	30.0	50.0	50.0
Fossil Fuel Reserves	–	-1.2	26.8	99.2	-3.7	-4.2	50.0
Brown Revenues	–	9.5	36.9	97.5	11.2	21.1	50.0
Green Revenues	–	-6.9	-27.1	-34.3	1.5	-7.6	100.1
Adaptation Score	–	-0.1	0.0	0.7	0.0	-0.5	10.0

## Climate Summary (versus MSCI World)

Results are based on data from July 2013 to July 2019 using \$ Gross Returns. The companies in the analysis were drawn from the MSCI World Index constituents. The benchmark portfolio is the MSCI World Index. Performance data was calculated using a monthly rebalancing frequency. See J. Bender, K. Shah, T. A. Bridges, and A. Weiner, *Values at Work*, [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-55613-6\\_10](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-55613-6_10). D. C. Esty and T. Cort (eds.), The data displayed for the Hypothetical Portfolio Returns is a hypothetical example of Back-Tested Performance for illustrative purposes only and is not indicative of the past or future performance of any SSGA product. Back-Tested Performance does not represent the results of actual trading but is achieved by means of the retroactive application of a model designed with the benefit of hindsight. Actual performance results could differ substantially, and there is the potential for loss as well as profit. The Back-Tested Performance may not take into account material economic and market factors that would impact the adviser's actual decision-making. The performance reflects management fees, transaction costs, and other fees and expenses a client would have to pay, which reduce returns.

---

## What's Next?

Screening-based or exclusionary approaches have been the most widely used portfolio-level solution for building climate-aware investment portfolios. Fossil fuel divestment, for instance, gained popularity in the 2000s, generating high profile headlines, before experiencing a backlash in the 2010s because of its impact on financial performance.

With advancements in data and portfolio construction, investors can use a variety of new portfolio construction frameworks to help them meet their carbon reduction and climate-related investment objectives, while also minimizing the amount of risk they have to assume in deviating from their policy benchmarks.

Here, we've outlined the notion of using optimization-based portfolio construction techniques to embed climate mitigation and adaptation approaches in equity portfolios. When contrasting these to screening-based portfolio construction, it's clear that optimization-based approaches can achieve stated climate goals with less active risk. In other words, they are more risk efficient.

As climate considerations and sustainable investing issues become increasingly important for all types of investors, we expect to see further innovations in data integration, portfolio-level techniques, and climate finance research. In particular, there are a number of outstanding questions around the relationship between climate-related metrics and traditional investment approaches — from the potential impact on portfolio tail risk, to whether carbon is priced into markets, and within which asset classes over various time horizons.

Finally, we expect governments and regulators to take significant action in the coming decades as nations attempt to further support the Paris Agreement. However, even without the intervention of governments, we know that climate-related research is likely to be an ever-increasing, important field of finance, and institutional investors who are focused on long-term value creation will be critical to help avoid the tragedy of the horizon – the good news is that there are clearly steps that investors can relatively easily take now to be part of the solution.

---

## Further Reading

- 1 Bender, J., Bridges, T. A., & Shah, K. (2019). Reinventing Climate Investing: building equity portfolios for climate risk mitigation and adaptation. *Journal of Sustainable Finance & Investment*, 9(3), 191-213.
- 2 EU Technical Expert Group. (2019). Report on Benchmarks. European Union.
- 3 IPCC. (2014). *Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report*. Geneva, Switzerland.
- 4 PRI. (2019). *The Inevitable Policy Response: Act Now*. London: United Nations .
- 5 United Nations. (2015). *Paris Agreement*.

## About State Street Global Advisors

Our clients are the world's governments, institutions and financial advisors. To help them achieve their financial goals we live our guiding principles each and every day:

- Start with rigor
- Build from breadth
- Invest as stewards
- Invent the future

For four decades, these principles have helped us be the quiet power in a tumultuous investing world. Helping millions of people secure their financial futures. This takes each of our employees in 31 offices around the world, and a firm-wide conviction that we can always do it better. As a result, we are the world's third-largest asset manager with US \$3.47 trillion\* under our care.

\* This figure is presented as of December 31, 2020 and includes approximately \$75.17 billion of assets with respect to SPDR products for which State Street Global Advisors Funds Distributors, LLC (SSGA FD) acts solely as the marketing agent. SSGA FD and State Street Global Advisors are affiliated.

### ssga.com

**Marketing Communication.  
For Professional Clients/Qualified  
Investors Use Only.**

#### State Street Global Advisors Worldwide Entities

**Abu Dhabi:** State Street Global Advisors Limited, ADGM Branch, Al Khatem Tower, Suite 42801, Level 28, ADGM Square, Al Maryah Island, P.O. Box 76404, Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates. Regulated by the ADGM Financial Services Regulatory Authority. T: +971 2 245 9000. **Australia:** State Street Global Advisors, Australia, Limited (ABN 42 003 914 225) is the holder of an Australian Financial Services License (AFSL Number 238276). Registered office: Level 14, 420 George Street, Sydney, NSW 2000, Australia. T: +612 9240-7600. F: +612 9240-7611. **Belgium:** State Street Global Advisors Belgium, Chaussée de La Hulpe 120, 1000 Brussels, Belgium. T: 32 2 663 2036. F: 32 2 672 2077. SSGA Belgium is a branch office of State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited. State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, registered in Ireland with company number 145221, authorized and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland, and whose registered office is at 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. **Canada:** State Street Global Advisors, Ltd., 1981 McGill College Avenue, Suite 500, Montreal, Qc, H3A 3A8, T: +514 282 2400 and 30 Adelaide Street East Suite 800, Toronto, Ontario M5C 3G6. T:

+647 775 5900. **France:** State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Paris branch is a branch of State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, registered in Ireland with company number 145221, authorized and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland, and whose registered office is at 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Paris Branch, is registered in France with company number RCS Nanterre 832 734 602 and whose office is at Immeuble Défense Plaza, 23-25 rue Delarivière-Lefoullon, 92064 Paris La Défense Cedex, France. T: (+33) 1 44 45 40 00. F: (+33) 1 44 45 41 92. **Germany:** State Street Global Advisors GmbH, Brienner Strasse 59, D-80333 Munich. Authorized and regulated by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht ("BaFin"). Registered with the Register of Commerce Munich HRB 121381. T: +49 (0)89-55878-400. F: +49 (0)89-55878-440. **Hong Kong:** State Street Global Advisors Asia Limited, 68/F, Two International Finance Centre, 8 Finance Street, Central, Hong Kong. T: +852 2103-0288. F: +852 2103-0200. **Ireland:** State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited is regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland. Registered office address 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. Registered Number: 145221. T: +353 (0)1 776 3000. F: +353 (0)1 776 3300. **Italy:** State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Milan Branch (Sede Secondaria di Milano) is a branch of State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, registered in Ireland with company number 145221, authorized and regulated by the Central

Bank of Ireland, and whose registered office is at 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Milan Branch (Sede Secondaria di Milano), is registered in Italy with company number 10495250960 - R.E.A. 2535585 and VAT number 10495250960 and whose office is at Via Ferrante Aporti, 10 - 20125 Milano, Italy. T: +39 02 32066 100. F: +39 02 32066 155. **Japan:** State Street Global Advisors (Japan) Co., Ltd., Toranomon Hills Mori Tower 25F 1-23-1 Toranomon, Minato-ku, Tokyo 105-6325 Japan. T: +81-3-4530-7380. Financial Instruments Business Operator, Kanto Local Financial Bureau (Kinsho #345), Membership: Japan Investment Advisers Association, The Investment Trust Association, Japan, Japan Securities Dealers' Association. **Netherlands:** State Street Global Advisors Netherlands, Apollo Building, 7th floor Herikerbergweg 29 1101 CN Amsterdam, Netherlands. T: 31 20 7181701. SSGA Netherlands is a branch office of State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, registered in Ireland with company number 145221, authorized and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland, and whose registered office is at 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. **Singapore:** State Street Global Advisors Singapore Limited, 168, Robinson Road, #33-01 Capital Tower, Singapore 068912 (Company Reg. No: 200002719D, regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore). T: +65 6826-7555. F: +65 6826-7501. **Switzerland:** State Street Global Advisors AG, Beethovenstr. 19, CH-8027 Zurich. Registered with the

Register of Commerce Zurich CHE-105.078.458. T: +41 (0)44 245 70 00. F: +41 (0)44 245 70 16. **United Kingdom:** State Street Global Advisors Limited. Authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority. Registered in England. Registered No. 2509928. VAT No. 577659181. Registered office: 20 Churchill Place, Canary Wharf, London, E14 5HJ. T: 020 3395 6000. F: 020 3395 6350. **United States:** State Street Global Advisors, 1 Iron Street, Boston, MA 02210-1641. T: +1 617 786 3000.

#### Important Risk Information

**Regarding performance table on Page 4:** Academic research for illustrative purposes only. The returns shown above are hypothetical and are based on the returns of the underlying market indices in the proportions shown above. Market indices are unmanaged and not subject to fees and expenses which would lower returns. Neither index performance nor sample portfolio performance is intended to represent the performance of any particular mutual fund, exchange-traded fund or product offered by SSGA Funds Management, Inc. SSGA Funds Management, Inc. has not managed any accounts or assets in the strategies represented by the sample portfolios above. Actual performance may differ substantially from the hypothetical performance presented. Past performance is not a guarantee of future results.

The whole or any part of this work may not be reproduced, copied or transmitted or any of its contents disclosed to third parties without SSGA's express written consent. Investing involves risk including the risk of loss of principal.

All information is from SSGA unless otherwise noted and has been obtained from sources believed to be reliable, but its accuracy is not guaranteed.

The returns on a portfolio of securities which exclude companies that do not meet the portfolio's specified ESG criteria may trail the returns on a portfolio of securities which include such companies. A portfolio's ESG criteria may result in the portfolio investing in industry sectors or securities which underperform the market as a whole.

The views expressed in this material are the views of the Global Equity Beta Solutions team as at November 2019 and are subject to change based on market and other conditions. This document contains certain statements that may be deemed forward-looking statements. Please note that any such statements are not guarantees of any future performance, and actual results or developments may differ materially from those projected.

#### **For EMEA**

The information provided does not constitute investment advice and it should not be relied on as such. It should not be considered a solicitation to buy or an offer to sell a security. It does not take into account any investor's particular investment objectives, strategies, tax status or investment horizon. You should consult your tax and financial advisor.

**The information contained in this communication is not a research recommendation or 'investment research' and is classified as a 'Marketing Communication' in accordance with the Markets in Financial Instruments Directive (2014/65/EU) or applicable Swiss regulation. This means that this marketing communication (a) has not been prepared in accordance with legal requirements designed to promote the independence of investment research (b) is not subject to any prohibition on dealing ahead of the dissemination of investment research.**

This communication is directed at professional clients which includes eligible counterparties as defined by the appropriate EU Regulator or applicable Swiss Regulator who are deemed both knowledgeable and experienced

in matters relating to investments. The products and services to which this communication relates are only available to such persons and persons of any other description (including retail clients) should not rely on this communication.

© 2021 State Street Corporation.  
All Rights Reserved.  
ID401726-2836915.1.4.GBL.RTL 0221  
Exp. Date: 28/02/2022