

Guidelines for Mitigating Reputational Risk in C-Suite Pay

June 1, 2016 | Market Commentary

Key Takeaways

- Peer group comparison and industry benchmarking has resulted in significant increases in C-Suite compensation across industries in the US. Given the growing income inequality in the country,¹ State Street Global Advisors (SSGA) sees increased reputational risk arising from the high quantum of pay to C-Suite executives; in 2018, this risk will be further heightened when companies begin disclosing CEO to median employee pay as mandated by the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC).
- SSGA has typically focused its attention on enhancing the pay-for-performance element of C-Suite compensation. However, with overall CEO pay remaining largely stable or increasing despite performance challenges,² the variability in pay and its link to performance is not apparent to investors.
- Many directors cite competitive pressures, industry practice and talent retention as reasons for the ever-increasing compensation levels. Acknowledging the competitive challenges that limit a board's ability to address the growing reputational risk from high quantum of pay, SSGA believes passive index investors need to take action to mitigate long-term reputational risk stemming from these practices.
- Consequently, SSGA has developed a screen that identifies companies where C-Suite compensation is well above the average CEO pay at Dow 30 companies. We believe that elevating investor concerns regarding overly excessive C-Suite compensation is needed to empower directors to take appropriate action to mitigate reputational risk in C-Suite pay.
- Finally, we have provided guidance for directors on ways to identify and mitigate reputational risk in pay.

Background

During the 2016 proxy season, when analyzing pay at US companies, SSGA's governance analysts noted a lack of variability in the year-to-year compensation packages of C-Suite executives. When evaluated in the context of poor performance and shareholder returns of the past year, the stable nature of compensation payouts was surprising given that investors have been working since 2011 to strengthen the pay-for-performance aspect in compensation.

Some of the methods used by companies to circumvent the pay-for-performance alignment include:

- Increased base salary and/or long-term stock grants that made up the decrease in short-term bonus payouts
- Above-target payouts under annual bonus plans for exceeding short-term performance goals that were recalibrated downwards in the middle of the performance cycle
- Relying on the discretionary element in compensation to pay out annual short-term bonus at-or-above target levels despite the failure to meet financial and business targets
- Additional one-time or multi-year grants that increased overall compensation in a given year

Our observations were confirmed by the Institutional Investor Services' May 11, 2016 publication — A Look at Compensation Trends. The report, which was published at the mid-point of the US proxy season, noted that when adjusted for pensions, the median increase in CEO pay in S&P 500 companies was 3.7% in 2015, compared with 4.6% in 2014 and 8.8% in 2013. While the growth in median pay is slowing, the overall trend of increasing CEO pay despite poor stock performance is of concern to investors.

The debate on income inequality in the current political environment has brought heightened focus on the quantum of CEO pay at US companies. This year alone, we have seen worker unions strike against companies citing high CEO pay,³ and politicians naming and shaming companies for their low employee wages and high executive compensation practices.⁴ Such negative publicity has the potential of damaging a company's brand with customers and impacting the long-term returns for shareholders.

Why Investor Action is Needed to Help Mitigate Reputational Risk in Pay

SSGA has been engaging on compensation-related matters with directors for a few years. On occasions when we have raised concerns with quantum of C-Suite compensation, directors have communicated the competitive challenges that limit their ability to address our concerns. As a long-term passive index investor, the rising reputation risk from pay is a serious concern. In the absence of action by directors, investors need to hold companies to a set of

common expectations that requires boards to assess and mitigate reputational risk in C-Suite pay. Failure to act on this issue could potentially result in C-Suite pay regulation similar to that introduced in the European Union,⁵ which has had unintended consequence for long-term investors.

As a result, this year we developed a screen to identify companies that may be building up reputational risk due to the current quantum of C-Suite compensation. We are adding this screen to our growing suite of proprietary ESG screens developed to help identify companies for engagement and proxy voting.

SSGA's Excessive Pay Screen

Our screen leverages reported compensation granted in the 'Summary Compensation Tables' in proxy statements at Dow 30 companies. Factors that were considered in designing the benchmarking screen were:

- Size of company by market capitalization and revenue, complexity of business and geographic footprint
- Mix of companies from different sectors to accommodate for competitive aspects of sector-specific differences in pay levels
- Reputation and ability of management to create and deliver value to investors over the long-term
- Additional buffers to the average benchmark compensation to accommodate and pay for superior and sustained performance

Based on 2015 CEO pay data for all proxies filed by April 30, 2016, 38 companies in the Russell 3000 were identified through our screen. The total compensation, excluding pension, at these outlier companies reached a maximum of \$119M, with the average reported total compensation being \$40M. SSGA recognizes that a majority of these companies are large-cap and that the screen may be ineffective in addressing quantum concerns in mid-and-small cap companies. However, given that the primary purpose of the screen is to empower boards to mitigate reputational risk in pay, we believe it is appropriate at this time to focus on quantum issues in large-cap companies that tend to be targeted in the media. We also hope that directors of small-and-mid-cap companies respond to this guidance and proactively take action to rationalize pay levels in their companies.

Guidance for Compensation Committee Members on Mitigating Reputational Risk in Pay

- Scenario test C-Suite compensation packages to threshold, target and stretch goals established by the board to understand the variability of the total compensation payout to performance, as well the variability within each pay component
- Introduce reasonable maximum payout limits as percentage of base pay on short-term and long-term compensation plans
- Disclose the maximum payout limits under each pay component to shareholders; this will enhance transparency and will help set investor expectations with regards to quantum of pay built into the current compensation plan
- Explain anomalies in pay that may increase reputational risk for the company in a given year and demonstrate how the board has mitigated this risk through pay design

We hope that board members of our portfolio companies find this guidance useful. Any questions or comments regarding this guidance may be directed to Rakhi Kumar, Senior Managing Director, Head of ESG and Asset Stewardship at Rakhi.Kumar@SSGA.com.

¹ CEO pay continues to raise as typical workers are paid less, Economic Policy Institute, June 12, 2014 <http://epi.org/publication/ceo-pay-continues-to-rise/>.

² US Proxy Season 2016 Midterm Analysis — A look at Compensation Trends, Institutional Shareholder Services, May 11, 2016.

³ Striking Verizon union is demanding big changes to executive pay, NJ.com, May 5, 2016 http://nj.com/business/index.ssf/2016/05/verizons_striking_union_is_demanding_big_changes_to_executive_pay.html.

⁴ When CEO pay exploded, NPR, February 5, 2016 <http://npr.org/sections/money/2016/02/05/465747726/-682-when-ceo-pay-exploded>.

⁵ Europe moves to a Swiss-style executive pay curbs, Reuters, March 6, 2013 <http://reuters.com/article/us-eu-pay-idUSBRE9250WM20130306>.

ssga.com

State Street Global Advisors Worldwide Entities

Australia: State Street Global Advisors, Australia, Limited (ABN 42 003 914 225) is the holder of an Australian Financial Services Licence (AFSL Number 238276). Registered office: Level 17, 420 George Street, Sydney, NSW 2000, Australia. T: +612 9240 7600. F: +612 9240 7611. **Belgium:** State Street Global Advisors Belgium, Chaussée de La Hulpe 120, 1000 Brussels, Belgium. T: 32 2 663 2036. F: 32 2 672 2077. SSGA Belgium is a branch office of State Street Global Advisors Limited. State Street Global Advisors Limited is authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority in the United Kingdom. **Canada:** State Street Global Advisors, Ltd., 770 Sherbrooke Street West, Suite 1200 Montreal, Quebec, H3A 1G1, T: +514 282 2400 and 30 Adelaide Street East Suite 500, Toronto, Ontario M5C 3G6. T: +647 775 5900. **Dubai:** State Street Bank and Trust Company (Representative Office), Boulevard Plaza 1, 17th Floor, Office 1703 Near Dubai Mall & Burj Khalifa, P.O Box 26838, Dubai, United Arab Emirates. T: +971 (0)4 4372800. F: +971 (0)4 4372818. **France:** State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Paris branch is a branch of State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, registered in Ireland with company number 145221, authorized and regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland, and whose registered office is at 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited, Paris Branch, is registered in France with company number RCS Nanterre 832 734 602 and whose office is at Immeuble Défense Plaza, 23-25 rue Delarivière-Lefoullon, 92064 Paris La Défense Cedex, France. T: (+33) 1 44 45 40 00. F: (+33) 1 44 45 41 92. **Germany:** State Street Global Advisors GmbH, Briener Strasse 59, D-80333 Munich. Authorized and regulated by the Bundesanstalt für Finanzdienstleistungsaufsicht ("BaFin"). Registered with the Register of Commerce Munich HRB 121381. T: +49 (0)89 55878 400. F: +49 (0)89 55878 440. **Hong Kong:** State Street Global Advisors Asia Limited, 68/F, Two International Finance Centre, 8 Finance Street, Central, Hong Kong. T: +852 2103 0288. F: +852 2103 0200. **Ireland:** State Street Global Advisors Ireland Limited is regulated by the Central Bank of Ireland. Registered office address 78 Sir John Rogerson's Quay, Dublin 2. Registered number 145221. T: +353 (0)1 776 3000. F: +353 (0)1 776 3300. **Italy:** State Street Global Advisors Limited, Milan Branch (Sede Secondaria di Milano) is a branch of State Street Global Advisors Limited, a company registered in the UK, authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority (FCA), with a capital of GBP 62,350,000, and whose registered office is at 20 Churchill Place, London E14 5HJ. State Street Global Advisors Limited, Milan Branch (Sede Secondaria di Milano), is registered in Italy with company number 06353340968 - R.E.A. 1887090 and VAT number 06353340968 and whose office is at Via dei Bossi, 4 - 20121 Milano, Italy. T: 39 02 32066 100. F: 39 02 32066 155. **Japan:** State Street Global Advisors (Japan) Co., Ltd., Toranomon Hills Mori Tower 25F 1-23-1 Toranomon, Minato-ku, Tokyo 105-6325 Japan. T: +81-3-4530-7380 Financial Instruments Business Operator, Kanto

Local Financial Bureau (Kinsho #345), Membership: Japan Investment Advisers Association, The Investment Trust Association, Japan, Japan Securities Dealers' Association. **Netherlands:** State Street Global Advisors Netherlands, Apollo Building, 7th floor Herikerbergweg 29 1101 CN Amsterdam, Netherlands. T: 31 20 7181701. SSGA Netherlands is a branch office of State Street Global Advisors Limited. State Street Global Advisors Limited is authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority in the United Kingdom. **Singapore:** State Street Global Advisors Singapore Limited, 168, Robinson Road, #33-01 Capital Tower, Singapore 068912 (Company Reg. No: 200002719D, regulated by the Monetary Authority of Singapore). T: +65 6826 7555. F: +65 6826 7501. **Switzerland:** State Street Global Advisors AG, Beethovenstr. 19, CH-8027 Zurich. Authorized and regulated by the Eidgenössische Finanzmarktaufsicht ("FINMA"). Registered with the Register of Commerce Zurich CHE-105.078.458. T: +41 (0)44 245 70 00. F: +41 (0)44 245 70 16. **United Kingdom:** State Street Global Advisors Limited. Authorized and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority. Registered in England. Registered No. 2509928. VAT No. 5776591 81. Registered office: 20 Churchill Place, Canary Wharf, London, E14 5HJ. T: 020 3395 6000. F: 020 3395 6350. **United States:** State Street Global Advisors, One Iron Street, Boston MA 02210. T: +1 617 786 3000.

Investing involves risk including the risk of loss of principal.

The whole or any part of this work may not be reproduced, copied or transmitted or any of its contents disclosed to third parties without SSGA's express written consent.

This document may contain certain statements deemed to be forward-looking statements. All statements, other than historical facts, contained within this document that address activities, events or developments that SSGA expects, believes or anticipates will or may occur in the future are forward-looking statements. These statements are based on certain assumptions and analyzes made by SSGA in light of its experience and perception of historical trends, current conditions, expected future developments and other factors it believes are appropriate in the circumstances, many of which are detailed herein. Such statements are subject to a number of assumptions, risks, uncertainties, many of which are beyond SSGA's control. Please note that any such statements are not guarantees of any future performance and that actual results or developments may differ materially from those projected in the forward-looking statements.

The information provided does not constitute investment advice and it should not be relied on as such. It should not be considered a solicitation to buy or an offer to sell a security. It does not take into account any investor's particular investment objectives, strategies, tax status or investment horizon. You should consult your tax and financial advisor. All material has been obtained from sources believed to be reliable. There is no representation or warranty as to the accuracy of the information and State Street shall have no liability for decisions based on such information.